



STATE OF NEW JERSEY

**FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of Bette Feldeisen,
Assistant Supervisor of Building
Repairs, (PS0530J), Richard Stockton
University

Examination Appeal

CSC Docket No. 2020-2280

ISSUED: May 1, 2020 (RE)

Bette Feldeisen appeals the decision of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) that she did not meet the experience requirements for the promotional examination for Assistant Supervisor of Building Repairs, (PS0530J), Richard Stockton University.

The subject promotional examination announcement was issued with a closing date of September 23, 2019 and was open to employees in the competitive division who were serving in the title Crew Supervisor Repairers Clerk OR to employees in the competitive division who were serving in any competitive title and possessed two years of supervisory experience in the maintenance and repair of buildings and grounds, which shall have included the preparation of cost estimates and workable shop drawings. The appellant was found to be below the minimum requirements in experience. As the appellant was the sole candidate, the examination was cancelled on February 28, 2020.

The appellant listed experience in the following positions on her application: provisional Assistant Supervisor of Building Repairs; Supervisor of Plumbers and Pipefitters; and Plumber. None of this experience was accepted, and she was found to be lacking two years of qualifying experience.

On appeal, the appellant explains that she was provisionally appointed to the subject title in December 2018 after her supervisor, the prior incumbent, retired, and she provides a few duties of her provisional position, and of a prior position.

CONCLUSION

N.J.A.C. 4A:4-2.6(a)2 states that applicants for promotional examinations must meet all requirements by the announced closing date.

The appellant was denied admittance to the subject examination since she lacked at least two years of experience in the maintenance and repair of buildings *and* grounds. In order for experience to be acceptable, it must mirror the experience required in the examination announcement. In addition, it must have as its **primary** focus full-time responsibilities in the areas required in the announcement. *See In the Matter of Bashkim Vlashi* (MSB, decided June 9, 2004). Also, an experience requirement that lists a number of duties which define the primary experience, requires that the applicants demonstrate that they primarily performed all of those duties for the required length of time. Performance of only one or some of the duties listed is not indicative of comprehensive experience. *See In the Matter of Jeffrey Davis* (MSB, decided March 14, 2007). In this case, the appellant clearly has more than two years of experience in the maintenance and repair of buildings, but none in grounds.

The appellant lists the duties of her provisional position as:

In charge of all the repair and maintenance of plumbing systems and fixtures for Stockton University. Ensure all systems are in compliance with state and local codes. Supervise five trades people, monitor and direct workflow, address repair issues, solicit quotes from contractors, enlist my N.J. Master Plumbing License to anchor Stockton University's annual permit for plumbing work performed by the Plumbing shop.

On appeal, the appellant adds that her duties include ordering materials and supplies as needed and complying with all OSHA safety standards on use of materials and equipment; and referencing the work order system daily and utilizing this as a tool for record keeping regarding cost, materials used, and labor hours. An Assistant Supervisor of Building Repairs is responsible for supervising employees engaged in the repair, maintenance, minor construction, adjustment of mechanical installations and equipment, and maintenance of grounds. A review of the appellant's duties thus not establish that she is performing the work of an Assistant Supervisor of Building Repairs. As such, Agency Services should perform a review of the appellant's duties to determine the proper classification of her position. For eligibility purposes, it is not sufficient to be provisional in the title, but the candidate must also be performing the duties of the title. None of the remaining experience had applicable duties as the primary focus, and therefore, the appellant lacks two years of required experience. Should the classification review find that

the appellant is performing in-title work as an Assistant Supervisor of Building Repairs, another examination can be announced.

An independent review of all material presented indicates that the decision of Agency Services that the appellant did not meet the announced requirements for eligibility by the closing date is amply supported by the record. The appellant provides no basis to disturb this decision. Thus, the appellant has failed to support her burden of proof in this matter.

ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied, and the matter of the appellant's position classification be referred to Agency Services for review.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON
THE 29TH DAY OF APRIL , 2020



Deirdré L. Webster Cobb
Chairperson
Civil Service Commission

Inquiries
and
Correspondence

Christopher S. Myers
Director
Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs
Civil Service Commission
Written Record Appeals Unit
P. O. Box 312
Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Bette Feldeisen
Rahmaan Simpkins
Kelly Glenn
Records Center